



Setti D. Warren
Mayor

City of Newton, Massachusetts
Department of Planning and Development
1000 Commonwealth Avenue Newton, Massachusetts 02459

Telephone
(617) 796-1120
Telefax
(617) 796-1142
TDD/TTY
(617) 796-1089
www.newtonma.gov

Candace Havens
Director

**MINUTES OF PUBLIC MEETING AND PUBLIC HEARINGS
NEWTON HISTORICAL COMMISSION**

DATE: March 27, 2014

PLACE/TIME: City Hall, Room 202
7:30 p.m.

ATTENDING: David Morton, Acting-Chair Mark Armstrong, Member
Rodney Barker, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate
Bill Roesner, Member Nancy Grissom, Member
Len Sherman, Member Katy Hax Holmes, Staff
See Attendance List

ABSENT: Jean Fulkerson, Member
Ellen Klapper, Alternate

The meeting was called to order at 7:00 p.m. with David Morton presiding as Acting-Chair. Voting permanent members were Morton, Armstrong, Barker, Roesner, and Grissom. Alternate member Fitzmaurice voted. Barker left the meeting after the vote on 180-182 Cherry Street. Katy Holmes acted as recording secretary and the meeting was digitally recorded on an H2 device.

34 Trinity Terrace - Demolition Review

Request to demolish house.

Matthew Montgomery, realtor, represented owners Janet and Bryan Marler and presented an application for a full demolition of the house. Reasons for its removal were due to its condition, but the owners were not adverse to the NHC finding the building to be preferably preserved.

Staff reported that the stuccoed Colonial Revival house was built c. 1916 and was first owned by Edmund P. Lynch. By 1927 the owners were Henry and Helen Highman, a vice president working in Boston. By 1940 Edward and his violinist wife Marguerite Estaver lived in the house. Marguerite also wrote the 1973 book entitled "Symphony of Leaves." No changes to the house were recorded until a building permit was pulled in 1983 for a retaining wall. In 1986 a two story addition in the rear corner of the house was built to match the existing. Houses located at the end of this cul de sac are of a similar period of construction with minimal to no alterations. This neighborhood retains its early 20th century historic architectural context and staff recommended that this house be found preferably preserved.

Commission members looked at photos of the house. John O'Connor, an abutter at 21 Trinity Terrace, told the Commission that he thought this cul de sac was a terrific place to live and appreciated the architecture of houses on his street, including this one. He did not want to see this house replaced, and informed the Commission that the house was currently occupied by renters.

Armstrong made a motion to find the house preferably preserved. Fitzmaurice seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 27, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 7-0:

RESOLVED to find the house at 34 Trinity Terrace **preferably preserved**.

<u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u>	<u>Voting in the Negative</u>	<u>Abstained</u>
Rodney Barker, Member		
Dave Morton, Acting Chair		
Bill Roesner, Member		
Mark Armstrong, Member		
Nancy Grissom, Member		
Len Sherman, Member		
Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate		

297 Cabot Street – Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

Stanley Dobies and his spouse told the Commission of their plan to demolish their house of thirty years and build two handicap accessible units for him and his wife, and his daughter in the second unit. Though they have raised four children in the house and want to stay in Newton, they said, Mr. Dobies' mobility issues were making it hard to stay in their current house, and they did not believe they could afford to live elsewhere in Newton. The owner explained that many of the houses in their vicinity were two-family and had been altered in sometimes appropriate but mostly not appropriate ways. The owners also explained that it would be more expensive to retrofit their current house than it would be to build two new accessible units on the site.

Staff reported that the house was built c.1895 (owner said 1908), and that this vernacular Queen Anne style house had minimal structural changes over time and multiple owners. Windows have been replaced and the house is now aluminum-sided, but the porch detail appears to be original (owner refuted this). A building permit was pulled in 1916 for a new garage, with the owner listed as Charles L. Harteshome. By 1929 the owners are listed as Walter and Mary McGregor who worked in insurance. Subsequent owners are Farnham, Paul Moura (a consul for Brazil), Lane, Wartel and the current owner Stanley Dobies. The overall massing of this house is intact, and is contextually linked to other Queen Anne and Colonial Revival houses in the neighborhood, which shows varying levels of alteration over time. As such staff recommended that the house be found preferably preserved.

A Commission member said that though he understood the mandate of the demo delay ordinance, he could not see how the NHC was helping the cause of historic preservation by preventing home owners from building on their own lots. Discussion ensued about the Commission's purview.

Sherman made a motion to find the house not preferably preserved. Fitzmaurice seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 27, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 2-5:

RESOLVED to find the house at 297 Cabot Street **not preferably preserved**.

<u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u>	<u>Voting in the Negative</u>	<u>Abstained</u>
Dave Morton, Acting Chair	Rodney Barker, Member Bill Roesner, Member Mark Armstrong, Member Nancy Grissom, Member	
Len Sherman, Member	Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate	

The motion did not pass.

Armstrong made a motion to find the house preferably preserved. Roesner seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 27, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 6-1:

RESOLVED to find the house at 297 Cabot Street **preferably preserved**.

<u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u>	<u>Voting in the Negative</u>	<u>Abstained</u>
Jean Fulkerson, Member Rodney Barker, Member Mark Armstrong, Member Bill Roesner, Member Nancy Grissom, Member Len Sherman, Member	Dave Morton, Acting Chair	

360 Langley Road – Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

Fernando and Daniel Fonseca, owners of this house, told the Commission of their plan to demolish their house due to its small lot size and deteriorated condition. They wanted to build a new structure with an attached garage. Abutters in attendance from 12 Beecher Lane were curious as to what the new house would look like. Abutters from 366 Langley Road were also in attendance on behalf of their 90 year-old neighbor, who was concerned about dust and truck traffic. Commission members discussed their belief that though the house was in fair condition, it was representative of a historical context on Langley Road.

Staff reported that the house was built c. 1915, and that maps showed a house at this location in the 1880s, but this house appears to have been constructed later. A plumbing permit was pulled in 1918 by the Burke family, who also owned the 1880s structure at this location when it was known as Station Street. By 1929 the property was owned by Umberto and Mary Cassiani, laborer, and later as a landscape gardener. In 1939 a permit was obtained for removing and replacing a rear porch. In 1955, a permit was obtained for a rear room and bath. This house is in deteriorated condition but retains its massing and context with two neighboring houses on Langley Road. As such staff recommended that the house be found preferably preserved.

Grissom moved to find the house preferably preserved. Roesner seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 27, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 7-0:

RESOLVED to find the house at 360 Langley Road **preferably preserved**.

<u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u>	<u>Voting in the Negative</u>	<u>Abstained</u>
-----------------------------------	-------------------------------	------------------

Rodney Barker, Member
Dave Morton, Acting Chair
Bill Roesner, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Nancy Grissom, Member
Len Sherman, Member
Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate

12-14 Coyne Road – Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

Ward Shifman, owner of this house, presented his plan to demolish it.

Staff reported that the Ranch Style house was built in 1952, and that it had no permits pulled since it was constructed and had multiple owners. Built as part of an original 1950s post-war development of ranch houses, this and the house next door are the only two remaining on the cul-de-sac. Past owners have been Kaplan, a gas station worker; Simmons, shoe manufacturer; McDonough, retired; Cookson, widow of Harry Cookson past owner of Cookson Realty; Nusbaum, programmer; and Gilbert. The current owner purchased the house in about 2003. Though the house appears to retain all of its original detail and fabric, its style and condition do not appear to warrant a finding of historical significance. Staff therefore recommended that the house be found not to be preferably preserved.

Shifman told the Commission he wanted to build two units on the lot, and that the current house had serious structural issues. He also noted that the house next door at 8-10 Coyne had not gone to an NHC meeting. As an abutter in the audience, Roesner, a Commission member, commented that the historic context in this neighborhood was changing and the housing stock ran the risk of becoming more of a mishmash.

Grissom made a motion to find the house not preferably preserved. Armstrong seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 27, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 6-0, with one recusal:

RESOLVED to find the house at 12-14 Coyne Road **not preferably preserved**.

<u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u>	<u>Voting in the Negative</u>	<u>Abstained</u>
-----------------------------------	-------------------------------	------------------

Rodney Barker, Member		Bill Roesner, Member
Dave Morton, Acting Chair		
Mark Armstrong, Member		
Nancy Grissom, Member		
Len Sherman, Member		
Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate		

19 Maynard Street – Waiver Amendment

Request to amend waiver

Tom Frangos, builder for this project, and the owner presented their revised plan to save the large tree on the front of the lot in exchange for being allowed to use vinyl siding. At the February 27th meeting of this Commission, a conditional waiver was granted which allowed Andersen windows on the new house but not vinyl siding. The Commission discussed with the owner and builder their desire to see an alternative to vinyl used for the siding. The owner contended that other houses in the neighborhood had vinyl siding and that this house should also be allowed to use it. The Chair explained that the Commission could not speak to other projects in the neighborhood over which they had no review.

Roesner made a motion to deny the new waiver request. Barker seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 27, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 6-1:

RESOLVED to not grant an amended waiver for the house at 19 Maynard Street.

<u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u>	<u>Voting in the Negative</u>	<u>Abstained</u>
Rodney Barker, Member	Len Sherman, Member	
Bill Roesner, Member		
Dave Morton, Acting Chair		
Mark Armstrong, Member		
Nancy Grissom, Member		
Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate		

31 Kappius Path – Waiver Amendment

Request to amend waiver

The developer for this property, Armando Petruzzello, presented his revised plan to construct the new house one foot taller than was previously proposed due to a high water table. This house had been found heduled meeting and a demo delay waiver was granted in August 2013.

At the August meeting, Petruzzello presented an application to waive the remainder of the demolition delay at this property based upon plans for a replacement building. Staff stated that this 1948 Ranch style residence was located within Oak Hill Park on the path system. The building retains is original form, but the building now has vinyl siding and the windows have been replaced. The building's first occupants were Jack and Alyce Batten. Jack worked in the real estate business. Buildings in the vicinity are a mix of original Oak Hill Park residences, altered Oak Hill Park residences, and new construction. The property was placed on a demolition delay at the April 2013 meeting; the applicant is seeking a waiver of the remainder of the delay based upon plans for a replacement building. Lang stated that the building was fairly consistent with the guidelines the Commission had established regarding the review of replacement buildings in Oak Hill Park. Abutters and neighbors expressed opposition to the demolition and concern regarding the size of the proposed building, the orientation of the proposed building to the path system, the potential changing of grade, and disrupting the character of the neighborhood. Lang asked if the grade was proposed to be changed and Petruzzello responded that it would not be substantially changed. Wojciechowski suggested adding a door on the rear façade to face the path system.

The demo delay was waived by a vote of 4-0 based upon plans submitted with the following conditions: (1) that the building have a four-step front entrance above existing grade; (2) that 6/1 simulated divided light

windows be used; (3) that the building have at least one door facing the pathway; (4) that the doorway on the side of the building be eliminated; and (5) that revised plans be submitted and approved by staff.

Petruzzello reported that the house was now demolished, and it was found that the water table was too high to build the house foundation as was presented. The house was approved at 32', and he said it would rise approximately one more foot. He also wanted to raise the grade of the lot and construct a retaining wall around the property to mitigate the proposed new height. Abutters at 37 Kappius told the Commission that did not like the idea of a taller house, and that the builder should stick to his original plan. The earth mounding would be too high and potentially create drainage problems. This abutter also pointed out that in the August NHC decision for this property, specific mention was made to have the front steps start from existing grade. Abutters spoke to the integrity of the process and asked that it be respected by the builder.

Fitzmaurice made a motion to deny the waiver amendment request. Grissom seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 27, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 7-0:

RESOLVED to deny the waiver request for the house at 31 Kappius Path.

<u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u>	<u>Voting in the Negative</u>	<u>Abstained</u>
-----------------------------------	-------------------------------	------------------

Rodney Barker, Member
Len Sherman, Member
Bill Roesner, Member
Dave Morton, Acting Chair
Mark Armstrong, Member
Nancy Grissom, Member
Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate

56 Dorcar Avenue – Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

The developer for the property told the Commission that the house was a non-descript property, and that he wanted to build a new home that met building code. He also said he was surprised he had to come to an NHC meeting for approval because he never had to come to one before for a proposed ranch demolition.

Staff reported that this classic, brick, Ranch Style house built in 1955 appeared to be in original condition and maintained its neighborhood historic context. Owned by Joel and Blanche Seifer, wholesaler, the house was not sold again until about 1986 to Bill Rose. Michael Gilbert bought the house in 1998. Due to its intact representation of a contextually consistent ranch in a ranch neighborhood, staff recommended that this house be found preferably preserved.

Discussion ensued as to whether neighborhood historic context remained. Commission members argued for and against finding the house preferably preserved.

Armstrong made a motion to find the house not preferably preserved. Grissom seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 27, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 4-3:

RESOLVED to find the house at 56 Dorcar Avenue not preferably preserved.

<u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u>	<u>Voting in the Negative</u>	<u>Abstained</u>
Dave Morton, Acting Chair	Rodney Barker, Member	
Len Sherman, Member		
Mark Armstrong, Member	Bill Roesner, Member	
Nancy Grissom, Member	Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate	

180-182 Cherry Street – Waiver Request

Request to partially demolish residence

Mingzong Zou of CZ Development, otherwise known as Tom, owner of this house with CZ Development, presented his revised plans along with his new architect to demolish the north and rear east sides of the house for an addition.

Staff reported that this c.1870 end-gable house was likely built in the Italianate style but has lost much of its original detail, including brackets, windows, and the front porch. Having said that, the house maintains its massing and historical context in the neighborhood. Evidence of a house at this location first appears on the 1874 insurance maps under the ownership of the J.W. Conroy family, who continue to own the house through the 1960s. By 1971, John Marino was the owner and the two-car garage was built in 1975. The garage, because of its date of construction, does not meet the criteria for the demo delay ordinance and thus is not subject to NHC review. In 2010 a building permit was granted to replace the roof and add a ridge vent. In 2013 the house was sold to CZ Development. The neighborhood is a mix of twentieth-century infill development, as well as Italianate houses with Queen Anne style updates. Due to the fact that this neighborhood is a transitional mix of styles, with this house representing the oldest style of house in the neighborhood, staff recommended that the house be found preferably preserved.

The architect told the Commission that the new plans reduced the addition by 20% from what was proposed last month; improved the historical appropriateness of the designs; and took into account the rear sloping side of the lot. Commission members responded positively but had questions about proposed materials information and sizes of proposed windows in the main house and the addition. The abutters at 176 Cherry Street said they remained concerned about the north side property line.

Grissom made a motion to approve the proposed plans in concept, but needed more information on materials and sizes of proposed windows in the main house and addition and wanted to see the construction drawings. Armstrong seconded the motion.

At a regularly scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 27, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 7-0:

RESOLVED to conditionally waive the demo delay for the house at 180-182 Cherry Street.

<u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u>	<u>Voting in the Negative</u>	<u>Abstained</u>
Dave Morton, Acting Chair		
Rodney Barker, Member		
Len Sherman, Member		
Mark Armstrong, Member		
Bill Roesner, Member		
Nancy Grissom, Member		

After this vote, Rodney Barker left the meeting.

51 Plainfield Street – On the National Register; Waiver

Armando Petruzzello, owner of this property presented his revised plans for a new house at this location. Mr. Petruzzello came to the NHC in May 2013 where the property was found preferably preserved; and then in September and November 2013 for a waiver for a full demo, and each time a waiver was not granted. The owner returned with what he thought were revised plans in order to once again attempt to obtain a waiver. This is what Brian Lever reported on the building for the May meeting:

“This 1922 Dutch Colonial residence is located with the Pine Ridge Road and Plainfield Street National Register Historic District and therefore subject to an 18-month demolition delay. The district is listed for its architectural significance as an example of a transitional neighborhood with late 19th century architectural styles of Queen Anne and Shingle mixing with Colonial Revival, Craftsman and Tudor styles of the 20th century. The neighborhood is also listed for its association with the development of the village of Waban as a suburban neighborhood accessible to Boston via the train. The first occupants of this building were Rawson and Mabel Cohen. Rawson was a salesman in Boston. Later the building was owned by Benjamin and Helen Bullman. Benjamin worked as a heating engineer. Shortly after permitting the construction of the building, an attached garage was added to the side and rear of the building. The addition has matching brick and the garage doors face the rear of the property. Aside from the addition, the building appears to have no substantial alterations and retains its shiplap siding, windows, and wood trim. The building is also consistent in scale and style with others in the neighborhood and is listed as a contributing building to the district, staff’s recommendation is to find the building preferably preserved.”

In September 2013, the waiver was not approved for the following reasons: Commission members felt that additions could be added that have desirable modern amenities rather than a full demolition of the National Register-listed property. In November 2013, the waiver was not approved due to the Commission’s belief that additions off the back of the building could help to save its historic integrity, and that the new design placed most of the bulk of the building at the front of the lot unlike the existing building. At the February meeting, the owner and developer presented an older set of plans by mistake and promised to return to a future meeting with revised plans.

Commission members discussed the new plans. Some thought the designs showed improvement over previously submitted drawings. Others felt the house was still too big. Palladian arches in the design were not generally supported and a request was made to remove them. In addition, window depictions on the plans were not consistent in size or scale, and this request was made as well. Isabell Albrech of Windsor Road stated that the NHC found this house preferably preserved in May, and that it was an important part of the streetscape. She said nothing had changed since that decision. Other commission members felt that the architect was moving in the right direction with his plans.

Grissom made a motion to accept this design conceptually, but that more design work remained, particularly by incorporating flat-arch windows, reducing the size of the center window, re-articulating the window sizes, and removal of the vestigial roof and column before returning to the NHC for approval. Fitzmaurice seconded the motion.

At a regularly scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 27, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 6-0:

RESOLVED to accept this design and approve a waiver conditionally, but that more design work remained, particularly by incorporating flat-arch windows, reducing the size of the center window, re-articulating the window sizes, and removal of the vestigial roof and column before returning to the NHC for approval..

Voting in the Affirmative:

Dave Morton, Acting Chair
Len Sherman, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Bill Roesner, Member
Nancy Grissom, Member
Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate

Voting in the Negative

Abstained

123 Upland Avenue – Demolition Review

Request to partially demolish house

Ron Jarek, architect, and the owner of this house presented their plan to demolish the rear deck and side porch on this Cape Style house, and construct additions on both facades.

Staff reported that the house was built in 1940, and that this Cape Style house was built and owned by E.C. Davis Inc. with a one car garage. The house was owned by various families up until the 1970s. In 1999 Denise Robinson built a deck on the house, as well as a full rear dormer. With the exception of these minor alternations, the house appeared to be in its original condition and is a well maintained example of the cape style. As such, staff recommended that the house be found preferably preserved.

Grissom made a motion to find the house not preferably preserved. Sherman seconded the motion.

At a regularly scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 27, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 2-4:

RESOLVED to find this house at 123 Upland Avenue not preferably preserved

Voting in the Affirmative:

Nancy Grissom, Member
Len Sherman, Member

Voting in the Negative

Dave Morton, Acting Chair
Mark Armstrong, Member
Bill Roesner, Member
Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate

Abstained

The motion did not pass.

Roesner made a motion to find the house preferably preserved. Fitzmaurice seconded the motion.

At a regularly scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 27, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 4-2:

RESOLVED to find this house at 123 Upland Avenue preferably preserved

Voting in the Affirmative:

Dave Morton, Acting Chair
Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate

Voting in the Negative

Nancy Grissom, Member

Abstained

Len Sherman, Member

Mark Armstrong, Member

Bill Roesner, Member

Discussion ensued as to the merits and potential pitfalls of the proposed design. The architect told the Commission he wanted the design to be sympathetic to the architecture. Commission members noted that the proposed designs were mislabeled, and this needed to be corrected, but that the proposed scale of the additions was generally in keeping with the cape style of the house. Grissom made a motion to find the house not preferably preserved. Sherman seconded the motion.

Administrative Discussion:

Minutes

The November, December 2013 and January 2014 meeting minutes were presented for approval at this meeting and were approved.

Meeting adjourned 10:30 PM